The fifth meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts in the fiscal year 1917 was held in their office, 1729 New York avenue, northwest, Washington, D.C., on Friday, May 18, 1917.

The following members were present:

Charles Moore, the Chairman;

Frederick Law Olmsted;

Thomas Hastings;

Herbert Adams;

J. Alden Weir;

Wm. Mitchell Kendall;

also Colonel Wm. W. Harts, U.S. Army, their Secretary and Executive Officer.

The Commission was called to order at 9:15 a. m., and immediately proceeded to the business before it.

1. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE LAST MEETING, &c: The minutes of the preceding meeting held April 20, 1917, and of the committee meetings on April 30, 1917, and May 7, 1917, in New York City, were presented and approved.

2. MONTROSE PARK: In presenting for approval the minutes of the April meeting, Colonel Harts read the paragraph relating to the Commission's action at that time with respect to Montrose Park. He said that the paragraph embodied the main points, as he understood them, that were decided by the members during their personal inspection of the grounds at the time, but, as the subject was one of great importance, he wanted to be sure that his understanding was correct. There was no specific objection. Mr. Olmsted, however, stated that while there should undoubtedly be a formal treatment along the street entrance, it is doubtful whether it would be expedient to form that by moving piece by piece the formal treatment now bordering the rope walk. The putting in of a retaining wall along the sidewalk in front was considered altogether inadvisable, the suggestion being that instead the grade against the sidewalk should be adjusted gradually. After some discussion Colonel Harts was advised to have two studies prepared, one eliminating altogether the rope walk with bordering formal treatment and providing a formal treatment along the front of the park, and the other sketch retaining the rope walk with the elimination of the formal treatment bordering it.

3. MEADE MEMORIAL. Mr. Frank Miles Day, special architectural adviser of the Meade Memorial Commission of the State of Pennsylvania, appeared before the Commission by appointment with reference to studies he had prepared, marked respectively Scheme A, B, C, and D, for the placing of the Meade Memorial and the treatment of its surroundings in relation to the Grant Memorial. Considerable time was spent in going over these various schemes with Mr. Day. The members were much gratified with the progress that had been made since Mr. Day's appointment to the work. In general the most important points finally agreed upon were that, as shown on Scheme C, Second Street should go through, - that the Meade Memorial should be in the middle of the four rows of trees, - that the two trees toward the Mall probably should be omitted, - and that from Second Street to Third Street there should be only eight trees. The members thought the idea of cutting the Meade Memorial off from the Grant Memorial by trees and the keeping of the whole line of trees intact was very good.

Mr. Day also exhibited a number of rough sketches merely to show the thought the sculptor had given to the matter. One sketch in particular, showing a figure on a circular base, was thought well of; with reference to this a suggestion

was made that the limiting of the figure to twelve feet, with a slightly lower base than the one shown, would give better proportions. Mr. Adams wished to do away with the portrait statue, but Mr. Day said he feared his Commission would insist upon it. The final opinion, however, was that the two ideas should be studied out, namely, one a circular base with a portrait statue on top, and the other simply a circular base without the statue. (See Exhibit A)

The following resolution was thereupon unanimously adopted:

> RESOLVED, That the very illuminating studies submitted by the Meade Memorial Commission of the State of Pennsylvania through Mr. Frank Miles Day for the placing of the Meade Memorial, and for the treatment of the surroundings in relation to the Grant Memorial, confirm the excellence of the site originally proposed by the Meade Memorial Commission at a point midway between Second and Third streets and on the axis of the four rows of trees forming the northerly avenue of the Mall; furthermore, that at least two of the sketches for the memorial itself give promise of very good results, - that the suggestion in one of the sketches of an idealistic treatment instead of the usual portrait statue, possesses great artistic possibilities, - and that, should the Meade Memorial Commission set the example of treating our public memorials in an idealistic manner, in the opinion of the Commission of Fine Arts they would render a great service to the whole country.

4. SITE FOR BATHING BEACH: Colonel Harts brought up again the question of a definite location for the new bathing beach, which had been postponed from the April meeting. The site favored by the Office of Public Buildings and Grounds had been on the point of the south shore, but at the last meeting it was suggested that a better location would be on the shore of the small cove

between that point and the Inlet Bridge. Colonel Harts explained that his office had made a painstaking examination of the conditions, and that they were convinced that the eddies and currents in the cove were such that refuse would not flush out very readily: for this reason they were decidedly of opinion that the location on the point should be adhered to. The Commission agreed that, if after painstaking investigation, conditions were found which convinced Colonel Harts that the site would not do, they could not urge its adoption, and therefore approved the site on the point originally selected by the Office Of Public Buildings and Grounds. In connection with the establishment of the beach it was thought that a grade of one in ten would be about right.

Colonel Harts also showed several sketches for the main bath house in which the original design had been restudied, and in particular the long straight roof line broken. The members thought the scheme for the broken treatment much better, and spent considerable time in discussing various features of the new designs. The curved ensemble was approved with the suggestion for the omission of the roof over the central space and with straight sections from shower to shower, parallel to the basin wall.

5. CENTRAL SECTION FOR POTOMAC PARK FIELD HOUSE: Colonel Harts presented two schemes for the treatment of the central section of the field house being

constructed in East Potomac Park, one with an open patio and the other with a closed treatment featuring a direct cross circulation. It was pointed out by several of the members that the greater simplicity of the first scheme was to be preferred to the other and after considerable discussion the open treatment was adopted. Mr. Hastings voted against its adoption. The members, at the request of Colonel Harts also, gave opinions as to the best treatment of some of the minor details of both central feature and wings, which were pointed out direct to Mr. Peaslee, the landscape architect of the Office of Public Buildings and Grounds, who was present.

6. SUCCESSION OF MEMBERS, AND RESIGNATION OF CHAIRMAN AS SUCH: Colonel Harts called attention to the arrangement regarding succession of members adopted at the meeting held on March 20, 1914, after talking it over with the President, whereby two members of the Commission were to resign this year and two in 1918. He pointed out that Mr. Moore and Mr. Hastings were scheduled to resign on June 14, 1917, while Mr. Gilbert and Mr. Olmsted were to resign on June 14, 1918. He added that Mr. Gilbert's resignation of last fall disarranged the schedule somewhat, but suggested that as this resignation would undoubtedly be acceptable as one of the vacancies provided for this year, Mr. Moore's name be trans-

ferred on the schedule for resignation on June 14, 1918, in place of Mr. Gilbert's, leaving only one resignation to be submitted for this year. He gave a number of reasons why this is highly desirable. This arrangement was thereupon unanimously adopted.

Mr. Moore then submitted his resignation as Chairman of the Commission, giving his reasons therefor. Upon his insistence, the resignation was laid on the table, subject to action at the next meeting.

7. PROMOTION OF THE CLERK TO THE COMMISSION: In view of the various additional duties that have been imposed upon the position of Clerk to the Commission during the present fiscal year which are dissimilar from those required in previous years, the Commission authorized and directed the promotion and appointment of their clerk from $2,100 per annum to $2,500 per annum, to take effect June 1, 1917, and directed the change in the designation of the position from Clerk to the Commission to Assistant to the Secretary.

8. NEW BUILDING TO BE ERECTED OPPOSITE THE TREASURY DEPARTMENT AND IMMEDIATELY SOUTH OF BELASCO THEATER: The Chairman called to the attention of the members that Mr. Cass Gilbert had been requested by the Treasury Department to design

a Government building for the unoccupied plot of ground owned by the United States at the corner of Pennsylvania Avenue and Madison Place immediately south of the Belasco Theater, and that Mr. Gilbert had requested him to discuss the proposition informally with the members. He stated that the problem of design for that location was serious one, and one presenting many difficult features; for instance, whether the building was to be of the ordinary office type or a more elaborate structure, whether the cornice line of the Riggs National Bank and the American Security and Trust Company should be maintained, whether it was to be designed complete in itself or as a part of a Government structure eventually to occupy part or the whole of the block and necessitating the acquisition of the other highpriced occupied ground in that square. He said that he brought these points up now as that the members would have time to think over the situation before the matter is brought before the Commission officially later on. Considerable discussion ensued.

9. GOLF COURSE FOR EAST POTOMAC PARK: Colonel Harts informed the Commission that at the suggestion of the Chairman of the Committee on Appropriations of the House of Representatives he had engaged Mr. Walter Travis, the golf expert, to present a plan for the public golf links in East Potomac Park. Mr. Travis

had prepared this plan, and Colonel Harts now laid it before the members for criticism. He was asked to have a large-scale drawing made, showing present topography with proposed surface alterations, together with the laying out the golf links as proposed by Mr. Travis with suggestions for laying out trees to form the vistas.

10. ANNUAL REPORT: The Chairman read to the other members that part of the annual report of the Commission for the fiscal year 1916 which precedes the detailed statement of submission, &c., and covers general official observations of the Commission regarding the development of the National Capital, &c. No objections or criticisms were offered, and the report was approved.

11. DESIGN FOR CALVERT STREET BRIDGE: The design for the Calvert Street bridge which was selected by a committee with power as to the best from a number submitted at a conference in New York City on May 7th last with Engineer Commissioner Kutz and architect George Oakley Totten of Washington was laid before the Commission for their information, and the prominent features of the design, outlined in the minutes of that conference, reviewed.

12. DESIGNS FOR MONUMENTS IN ARLINGTON CEMETERY: The three architect members of the Commission, and Mr. Cass Gilbert, had each at a preceding meeting

agreed to prepare several designs for tombstones suitable for erection in Arlington Cemetery for the guidance of the Quartermaster Department in charge of that cemetery. All designs except those from Mr. Gilbert were in, and these were inspected and discussed. Later on the Chairman had the opportunity of a talk with the officer in charge of the cemetery, who expressed his great pleasure with the designs and appreciation of the Commission's cooperation, and promised to do everything in his power to get the results the Commission is after. The designs are to be sent over for the use and guidance of the Quartermaster Department.

13. The members then had lunch in the private office of Colonel Harts. They had as their guest Colonel Kutz, Engineer Commissioner of the District of Columbia, with whom certain features of heights of buildings were discussed.

After lunch the Commission convened in their Board Room, but, as there was no further business to come before the meeting, they adjourned, subject to the call of the Chairman.

Mark Hanna

Colonel, U. S. Army,

Secretary and Executive Officer.

Approved: Charles Moore

Chairman

Washington, D. C.,

May 28, 1917.

Sir:

At the meeting of the Commission of Fine Arts held on May eighteenth last the members gave careful consideration to various plans and sketches submitted by Mr. Frank Miles Day, your architectural advisor, for the location of the memorial and the treatment of its immediate vicinity. They were very much gratified at the progress made, and unanimously adopted the following resolution:

> RESOLVED, That the very illuminating studies submitted by the Meade Memorial Commission of the State of Pennsylvania through Mr. Frank Miles Day for the placing of the Meade Memorial, and for the treatment of the surroundings in relation to the Grant Memorial, confirm the excellence of the site originally proposed by the Meade Memorial Commission at a point midway between Second and Third streets and on the axis of the four rows of trees forming the northerly avenue of the Mall: furthermore, that at least two of the sketches for the memorial itself give promise of very good results, - that the suggestion in one of the sketches of an idealistic treatment instead of the usual portrait statue, possesses great artistic possibilities, - and that, should the Meade Memorial Commission set the example of treating our public memorials in an idealistic manner, in the opinion of the Commission of Fine Arts they would render a great service to the whole country.

By direction of the Commission:

Very respectfully,
Wm. W. Harts
Colonel, U. S. Army,
Secretary and Executive Officer.

Hon. M. G. Brumbaugh,
Governor of the State of Pennsylvania,
Chairman, Meade Memorial Commission
of State of Pennsylvania,
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.

Exhibit A.

Harrisburg, Pennsylvania,
Bureau of Municipal Research,
Governor Pinchot's Reform Administration,
Hon. M. S. Brumbaugh,
Governor of the State of Pennsylvania,
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.

Sir:

At the meeting of the Association of Life Insurance Presidents held on May 8th, 1924, the following resolutions were unanimously adopted upon the recommendation of the Committee on Legislation:

RESOLVED, That the Association of Life Insurance Presidents hereby expresses its appreciation of the services rendered by the Bureau of Municipal Research of the City of New York in the investigation of the affairs of the Department of Taxes and Assessments of the City of New York, and in the preparation of the report thereon, which has been of great assistance to the Committee on Taxation of this Association in its study of the subject of taxation, and

RESOLVED, That the Secretary of this Association be and he is hereby directed to transmit a copy of these resolutions to the Bureau of Municipal Research.

By direction of the Committee:

Very respectfully,

Colonel F. E. Crisp,
Secretary and Executive Officer.